```
WEBVTT
00:00:01.139 --> 00:00:11.038
New York state racing, her mutual wagering and breeding Law Section 102
provides of the New York state. Gaming Commission shall consist to 7
members.
00:00:11.038 --> 00:00:15.148
Appointed by the governor by, in, with the advice and consent to the
Senate.
00:00:15.148 --> 00:00:23.370
4 members confirmed by the New York state Senate are necessary to afford
the commission and ability to establish a quorum and undertake action.
00:00:23.370 --> 00:00:27.660
This present meeting of the commission is now called to order.
00:00:27.660 --> 00:00:42.539
This meeting is being conducted in conformity with chapter 1 of the laws
of 2022, such chapter authorizes state and local government entities to
meet and take such action authorized by law without permitting in person
00:00:42.539 --> 00:00:50.454
Public access to meetings and authorizes such meetings to be held
remotely by conference call or other similar service,
00:00:50.935 --> 00:00:52.494
provided that the public can view,
00:00:52.494 --> 00:00:57.715
or listen to such proceeding and that such meetings are recorded and
later transcribed.
00:00:58.049 --> 00:01:02.969
Accordingly this meeting is being conducted in conformance with such
allowance.
10
00:01:02.969 --> 00:01:11.040
And we are both allowing the public to listen to our proceeding and we
are recording today's meeting for transcription as required.
00:01:11.040 --> 00:01:14.819
Miss Secretary will you please call the role. John Crotty? Here
00:01:14.819 --> 00:01:19.290
Peter Moschetti Moschetti: here.
13
00:01:19.290 --> 00:01:23.370
John Poklemba: here Christopher Riano. Here
00:01:23.370 --> 00:01:28.290
Barry Sample: here. Jerry Skunick: here
```

```
00:01:28.734 --> 00:01:35.155
Miss secretary please have the record, reflect the quorum of qualified
members is present.
16
00:01:35.185 --> 00:01:44.304
Thus, enabling the transaction of business:
Minutes of the commission meeting conducted on February 28th 2022 has
been provided to the members in advance.
00:01:46.530 --> 00:01:49.680
At this time, I'd like to ask the members.
00:01:49.680 --> 00:01:53.370
Any any members have edits corrections or amendments.
00:01:53.370 --> 00:01:58.109
Hearing none.
00:01:58.109 --> 00:02:12.294
Miss Secretary, please let the record reflect that the minutes were
accepted.
Rulemaking, New York state racing, pari-mutuel wagering and breeding Law
section. 104.19 authorizes commissioned to promulgate rules and
regulations.
21
00:02:12.324 --> 00:02:25.495
That is deemed necessary to carry out its responsibility. In that regard.
The commission will from time to time promulgate rules and rule
amendments pursuant to the state administrative procedure act.
22
00:02:25.495 --> 00:02:39.775
Today we have 1 rule for adoption Rob?
For commission consideration is the adoption of a rule making to
authorize organizations to sell raffle tickets through the Internet or
mobile device platforms subject to prescribed commission regulation.
23
00:02:39.775 --> 00:02:49.284
This proposal harmonizes, the location requirements for servers or other
electronic equipment. That would accept Internet or mobile raffle wagers.
24
00:02:52.164 --> 00:02:59.905
With the requirements for servers or other electronic equipment that
accept sports wages the rule would implement general,
00:02:59.905 --> 00:03:01.224
municipal law section 189.16,
26
00:03:01.224 --> 00:03:13.555
which requires the commission to ensure that the purchase of a raffle
ticket is initiated and received or otherwise made on the premise of an
authorized organization or an authorized games of chance lessor,
```

```
2.7
00:03:13.854 --> 00:03:18.564
in a municipality that complies with the conditions set forth in general,
00:03:18.564 --> 00:03:21.264
municipal law sections 189.13 B1 through 189.13 B4.
00:03:29.485 --> 00:03:32.245
This proposal would require a charitable organization,
00:03:32.245 --> 00:03:39.625
wishing to conduct the Internet or mobile device raffle sales to
demonstrate that the server or other electronic equipment from the
Internet,
31
00:03:39.775 --> 00:03:46.375
or mobile raffle sales are initiated and located in compliance with
statutory requirements.
00:03:46.710 --> 00:03:52.830
Demonstrate geo location and capabilities to comply with the statutory
geo location requirements.
33
00:03:52.830 --> 00:03:57.270
Have the age verification procedures to prevent play by minors.
00:03:57.270 --> 00:04:03.629
Offer parental controls, have procedures to prevent promotional materials
being sent to minors.
00:04:03.629 --> 00:04:06.870
Have privacy protection procedures.
00:04:06.870 --> 00:04:14.819
Have procedures to protect the security of personal, important
information of ticket purchasers from unauthorized disclosure.
00:04:14.819 --> 00:04:18.839
And implement procedures to exclude persons on the
00:04:18.839 --> 00:04:22.500
The statewide self exclusion lists from making a purchase.
00:04:23.064 --> 00:04:36.774
In addition, software providers and platforms would be required to be
licensed as a games of chance, supplier and paragraph 7 through 9 of
commission rule. 4620.22 B, would be renumbered as paragraphs 9 through
11.
00:04:39.238 --> 00:04:45.028
The notice of proposed rulemaking was published in the state register on
January, 12, 2022.
41
00:04:45.028 --> 00:04:49.678
```

```
Meaning that the public comment period expired on March 14th, 2022.
42
00:04:50.004 --> 00:04:55.944
2 comments were received both from companies that provide technology
platforms for organizations,
43
00:04:55.944 --> 00:04:56.514
offering,
44
00:04:56.543 --> 00:04:57.564
charitable gambling,
00:04:58.194 --> 00:05:00.293
Ascend fundraising solutions,
00:05:00.713 --> 00:05:02.454
and Bump worldwide,
47
00:05:02.723 --> 00:05:03.653
incorporated,
00:05:04.584 --> 00:05:12.353
both ascend and bump expressed a preference for hosting websites in a
cloud based platform while proposed rule 46 2022.
49
00:05:12.353 --> 00:05:23.213
b7 Romanette 2 would require a server to be located in a municipality in
New York in which the sale of raffle tickets is authorized as set forth
in general, municipal law section. 189.13.
00:05:26.699 --> 00:05:39.869
The commentators make a policy argument that is inconsistent with the New
York statutes. General, municipal law section 189.16 incorporates the
general raffle location requirements.
51
00:05:39.869 --> 00:05:53.819
Of section, 189.13 requiring in the context of an Internet or mobile
application platform that a raffle wager be received, or otherwise made
in local locations.
00:05:53.819 --> 00:06:00.809
Staff believes the cyber space cloud would not satisfy statutory
requirements.
00:06:00.809 --> 00:06:07.408
Bump also asserts that having the server located locally would not make
the platform more secure.
54
00:06:07.408 --> 00:06:14.848
Because platform providers would not readily be available to access
control access or provide support and maintenance.
00:06:14.848 --> 00:06:21.658
```

```
Bump asserts that there would be no ability to ensure off site, backup
and storage of critical data.
00:06:21.658 --> 00:06:31.228
In states that the raffle requirement and raffle ticket purchase
requirement, be initiated and accepted in authorizing municipality could
be satisfied.
57
00:06:31.228 --> 00:06:34.499
Through portable or handheld electronic equipment.
58
00:06:34.499 --> 00:06:43.858
On a cloud based platform staff notes that there is no restriction in the
proposed rule that would prevent offsite backup of data.
59
00:06:43.858 --> 00:06:56.278
Bump and Ascend also suggest that proposed rule 46,022 b7 Romanette 3,
which requires the purchaser of a raffle ticket through an Internet or
mobile platform.
60
00:06:56.278 --> 00:07:02.519
The 1st, to establish a raffle ticket account would burden players and
negatively impact participations.
00:07:02.519 --> 00:07:05.608
Ascend suggests that guest purchases.
62
00:07:05.608 --> 00:07:08.728
Which we assumed to be non account based purchases.
00:07:08.728 --> 00:07:15.509
Should be permitted bump indicated that their current clients do not want
personal information of players.
64
00:07:15.509 --> 00:07:28.889
Nor want the risk associated with maintaining personal and sensitive
information. Staff believes the requirement to establish player counts is
consistent with the regulation of the other types of Internet based
wagering in New York.
00:07:28.889 --> 00:07:38.309
Namely advanced deposit wagering on horse racing, mobile sports,
wagering, lottery, subscriptions and interactive fantasy sports contests.
00:07:38.309 --> 00:07:48.509
Account establishment allows for the effective regulation of other
important policy objectives, such as responsible gaming and the
prevention of gambling by minors.
00:07:48.509 --> 00:08:03.418
As the sale of Internet Raffles is optional to an authorized
organization. Any that feel burdened by the regulatory requirements would
not be obligated to participate and could instead continue to sell raffle
tickets by traditional means.
```

```
68
00:08:03.418 --> 00:08:09.269
Both commentators also raised concern with the self-exclusion component
of the rules.
00:08:09.269 --> 00:08:15.149
Proposed rule section 46, 2022 Romanette 4.
00:08:15.149 --> 00:08:29.968
Romanette 6 C and Romanette 6 f would prohibit the sale of a raffle
ticket to persons on the commission self-exclusion list and require
procedures to prevent such purchases.
71
00:08:29.968 --> 00:08:42.778
In response bumps suggests a self-reporting verification step in states
that requiring an organization to double check. A self-reporting.
Verification is not plausible.
00:08:42.778 --> 00:08:47.519
Ascend inquired whether the collection of birth dates would suffice.
00:08:47.519 --> 00:08:50.333
And questions how self-exclusion would be implemented,
00:08:50.333 --> 00:08:54.833
and whether the commission would provide access to a database of self-
excluded persons,
00:08:55.913 --> 00:09:10.793
staff believes that self-verification of self-exclusion status would be
ineffective to prevent play of self-excluded persons and notes that
mobile sports wagering operators have been required to implement self-
exclusion procedures
76
00:09:10.793 --> 00:09:14.274
since they commenced operation in January. Commission,
00:09:14.274 --> 00:09:19.763
staff would also assist any licensee with the implementation of a self-
exclusion program.
78
00:09:20.339 --> 00:09:25.619
With respect to proposed rule 46,022 b7.
00:09:25.619 --> 00:09:40.379
Romanette 6 C Bump suggests that self-reporting of the age would
sufficiently protect a participant and that compliance and implementation
costs to the proposed rule would diminish charitable gaming revenue.
00:09:40.379 --> 00:09:46.889
Staff believes that self reporting of age would be ineffective to prevent
on a under age play.
81
00:09:46.889 --> 00:09:51.958
```

```
Proposed rule 46, 2022 b7.
82
00:09:52.043 --> 00:09:53.783
Roman at 6,
00:09:53.813 --> 00:10:08.573
C2 requires an authorized organization to demonstrate how it would
prevent underage play staff also notes the age verification is a
component of a wide variety of Internet gaming applications and as
00:10:08.573 --> 00:10:14.903
stated earlier an authorized organization that feels that they are
burdened by regulatory requirements.
00:10:16.019 --> 00:10:24.089
Are not obligated to sell raffle tickets on the Internet and could
instead continue to sell raffle tickets by traditional means.
86
00:10:24.089 --> 00:10:32.038
Finally staff notes a typographical error that should be corrected upon
adoption as a non-substantive change as the word.
00:10:32.063 --> 00:10:34.344
Or should be of,
88
00:10:34.614 --> 00:10:38.604
in 1 instance in proposed rule 46,022 be 7 Roman at 3 staff,
00:10:38.634 --> 00:10:49.703
recommends that the commission adopt this rule maker commissioners any
questions on the adoption of a rule authorizing regulation of charitable
gaming Internet Raffles.
00:10:54.808 --> 00:10:59.639
Hearing none may I have a motion to adopt this rule so.
00:10:59.639 --> 00:11:03.928
Any second? Discussion of the motion.
92
00:11:06.208 --> 00:11:10.349
Hearing none all in favor. Aye.
00:11:10.349 --> 00:11:16.499
Motion carried, uh, next item. Do we have any new business?
00:11:16.499 --> 00:11:20.818
Hearing none do we have any old business.
95
00:11:20.818 --> 00:11:28.619
Hearing none that will conclude our published agenda for the day.
00:11:28.619 --> 00:11:34.558
Um, traditionally we need the last Monday of the month.
97
```

```
00:11:34.558 --> 00:11:42.239
Of April, we work with Kristen to identify the appropriate date for everyone when we'd be available.
98
00:11:42.239 --> 00:11:46.048
And may have a motion to conclude today's meeting.
99
00:11:46.048 --> 00:11:50.038
So, move 6th.
100
00:11:50.038 --> 00:11:54.359
Thank you. Thank you. Mr.
```